BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06081927 3

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

PUBLIC SECTOR LABOUR LAW
CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME 1

Tim Hadwen
Richard A. Blair
University of Toronto Faculty of Law
Winter 2012

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN - 3 2012

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

PUBLIC SECTOR LABOUR LAW
CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME 1

Tim Hadwen
Richard A. Blair
University of Toronto Faculty of Law
Winter 2012

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/publicsectorlabo01hadw

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Unit 1 – Purpose of Public Sector Labour Law and Statutory Frameworks

1-2 Selected List of Statutes

1-3 Excerpt – *Crown Employees Collective Bargaining Act*

1-19 Excerpt from *Ontario Public Service Employment Labour Law,* Hadwen, Strang, Marvy and Eady, Irwin Law, 2005

1-21 Wellington, Harry H. and Winter, Ralph K. Jr., *The Limits of Collective Bargaining in Public Employment* (1969) Faculty Scholarship Series, Yale Law School

1-43 Swimmer, Gene and Bartkiw, Tim, *The Future of Public Sector Collective Bargaining in Canada*, Journal of Labour Research, Volume XXSIV, Number 4, Fall 2003, excerpt

1-57 Statistics Canada, Unionization 2011

1-60 Statistics Canada, Chart B

Unit 2 – Issues in Access to Collective Bargaining, Structure of Bargaining Units, and Choice of Bargaining Agents

2-2 Excerpts from *Ontario Public Service Employment Labour Law,* (Hadwen, Strang, Marvy, and Eady, Irwin Law, 2005

2-6 Excerpt from *Ontario Public Service Employment Labour Law,* Hadwen, Strang, Marvy and Eady, Irwin Law, 2005

2-17 Colleges Collective Bargaining Act, Schedule 1

2-20 Ontario Provincial Police Collective Bargaining Act (excerpt)

2-23 Historical Overview of Teachers' Collective Bargaining in Ontario

2-40 Education Act, s. 277.3 – 277.78

2-45 Fire Protection Act, s. 45 – 46

2-46 Discussion Paper, "Functional Bargaining Units in Alberta's Health Care Industry" Alberta Labour Relations Board Discussion Paper [1977] Alta. L.R.B.R. DP-003

2-52 Excerpts from *Stratford General Hospital*, [1976] OLRB Rep. Sept. 459

2-66 Memorandum between Governing Council and the University of Toronto and the University of Toronto Faculty Association

2-80 Excerpt from *Strofolino v. Helmstadter*, 2001 CanLii 27985 (ON SC)

2-91 History of the Association of Law Officers of the Crown

Unit 3 – Exclusions and Inclusions from Collective Bargaining

3-2 Exerpts from the report of Special Advisor His Honour Judge Walter Little, *Collective Bargaining in the Ontario Public Service*, May 1969

3-11 *University of Windsor Faculty Association*, [1977] OLRB Rep. May 300

3-18 *O.T.F. v. Ontario (Attorney General)*, 2000 CarswellOnt. 1988, Ontario Court of Appeal

3-30 *Ontario Public Service Employees Union v. The Crown in Right of Ontario*, [1998] OLRB Rep. May/June 400

3-38 *O.P.S.E.U. v. Ontario*, 2000CarswellOnt 4709, Ontario Court of Appeal

3-43 *Mounted Police Association of Ontario v. Canada (Attorney General)*, 2009 CanLII 15149 (ONSC)

Unit 4 – Statutory Employment Schemes

4-2 Excerpt from *Ontario Public Service Employment Labour Law,* Hadwen, Strang, Marvy and Eady, Irwin Law, 2005

4-6 Excerpts from *A Strong Foundation – Report of the Task Force on Public Service Values and Ethics,* Canadian Centre for Management Development, Government of Canada

4-18 *OPSEU (Union Grievance/Bliss et al.) v. The Crown in Right of Ontario (Ministry of Health),* Decision of the Ontario Public Service Grievance Settlement Board, GSB #80/93, 399/93, March 13, 1995

4-27 Excerpt from *Ontario Public Service Employment Labour Law,* Hadwen, Strang, Marvy and Eady, Irwin Law, 2005

4-31 "Staffing Policy", Public Service Commission Directives, HR Policy & Planning Branch, HR Management and Corporate Policy Division, HROntario, Ministry of Government Services

4-37 *A New Public Service Act for Ontario – Consultation Paper*, Ontario Ministry of Government Services, March 2006

4-45 *Ontario Public Service Employees Union (Group Grievance) v. The Crown in Right of Ontario (Ministry of Correctional Services)*, Decision of the Ontario Public Service Grievance Settlement Board, GSB #1999/98, March 1, 2002

4-50 "The *Public Service of Ontario Act* – Questions and Answers for Public Servants", Ontario, August 2007

4-59 *Regina Police Assn. v. Regina (City) Board of Police Commissioners*, [2000] 1 S.C.R. 360 (excerpt)

Unit 5 – Common Law of Public Sector Employment

5-2 *McKinley v. BC Tel*, [2001] S.C.J. No. 40 (excerpt)

5-7 *Levis (City) v. Fraternite des policies de Levis Inc.*, [2007] S.C.J. No. 14 (excerpt)

5-12 *Ontario (Provincial Police) v. Favretto*, 72 O.R. (3d) 681 (Ontario Court of Appeal

5-22 *Peel (County) Board of Education v. O.S.S.T.F.*, 2002 CarswellOnt 2430 (excerpt)

5-34 *Wellington Board of Education and O.S.S.T.F., Re*, [1991] O.L.A.A. No. 129

5-41 *Fraser v. Canada (Public Service Staff Relations Board)*, [1985] S.C.J. No. 71 (excerpt)

52
5-~~42~~ *Alberta Union of Provincial Employees v. Alberta*, 218 D.L.R. (4th) 16 (excerpt)

5-57 *Shaw v. Deputy Head (Department of Human Resources and Skills Development)*, [2006] C.P.S.L.R.B. No. 126

5-69 *Ontario Public Service Employees Union v. The Crown in Right of Ontario (Ministry of Community and Social Services) and Frank Drea*, Decision of the Ontario Public Service Labour Relations Tribunal, Decision #T/7/84

5-78 *Osborne v. Canada (Treasury Board)* [1991] 2 S.C.R. 69 (excerpt)

Unit 6 – Restricted Bargaining and Bargainability

6-2 *Public Sector Bargaining; Some Basic Considerations,* Finkleman, Jacob, address to a conference on "Current Problems in Public Sector Bargaining", Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario, January 15 1976

6-13 *Safety Belt or Strait-Jacket? Restrictions on the Scope of Public Sector Collective Bargaining*, Kenneth P. Swan, in "Essays on Collective Bargaining and Industrial Democracy", England and Lerner, ed., CCH, 1983

6-24 Excerpt from *Ontario Public Service Employment Labour Law,* Hadwen, Strang, Marvy and Eady, Irwin Law, 2005

6-28 *Toronto Catholic District School Board v. Ontario English Catholic Teachers' Association (Toronto Elementary Unit),* Ontario Court of Appeal, 2001 CanLii 8597

6-36 Ontario Regulation 492/01 under the *Education Act*

6-37 *Parry Sound (District) Social Services Administration Board v. O.P.S.E.U., Local 324*, [2003] 2 S.C.R. 157 (Excerpt)

6-46 *Health Services and Support – Facilities Subsector Bargaining Assn. v. British Columbia*, 2007 SCC 27

Unit 7 - Bargaining in the Public Sector in the absence of restrictions – selected examples

7-2 Collective Agreement between the Ontario Public Service Employees Union and the Crown in Right of Ontario, 2004 – 2008 agreement (excerpt – Appendix 9, Job Stability

7-6 *Ontario (Ministry of Transportation) and O.P.S.E.U.,* [1997]O.G.S.B.A. No. 3

7-22 Collective Agreement between OPSEU and the Crown, (current), Appendix 18

2-32 *Kawartha Pine Ridge District School Board v. Elementary Teachers' Federation of Ontario (Preparation Time Grievance)* [2007] O.L.A.A. No. 390

7-39 *St. Joseph's Health Care Hamilton v. Ontario Nurses Assn.* [2009] O.L.A.A. No. 432

Unit 8 – Essential Services

8-2 International Labour Organization, Committee on Freedom of Association, Digest of Decisions, 2006

8-10 *OPSEU v. The Crown in Right of Ontario as Represented by Management Board of Cabinet – Essential and Emergency Services*, [1995] OLRB Rep. June 735

8-17 *Ontario (Management Board of Cabinet)*, [2002] O.L.R.D. No. 1293

8-21 Essential Services Agreement (Correctional Bargaining Unit) between OPSEU and Management Board of Cabinet

8-31 *Beacon Hill Lodge v. BCNU and HEU,* [1986] B.C.L.R.B.D. No. 2

8-40 Excerpt from Bernard Adell, Michel Grant and Allen Ponak, *Strikes in Essential Services*, IRC Press, Industrial Relations Centre, Queen's University, 2001

Unit 9 - Constitutional Developments

9-2 *Ontario (Attorney General) v. Fraser,*, [2011] S.C.J. No. 20 (Excerpt)

9-14 *Association of Justice Counsel v. Attorney General of Canada*, 2011 ONSC 6435

9-42 *Federal Government Dockyard Trades and Labour Council v. Canada (Attorney General)*, [2011] B.C.J. No. 1697 (excerpts)

Unit 10 – Interest Arbitration

10-2 *Resolution of Interest Disputes,* Allen Ponak & Loren Falkenberg, from "Labour and Employment Law – Cases, Materials & Commentary, 8th Edition", The Labour Law Casebook Group, Irwin Law

10-7 *The Ontario Experience with Interest Arbitration: Problems in Detecting Policy",* Adams, George, Relations Industrielles/Industrial Relations, Vo. 36, no. 1, 1981, p. 225 – 250

10-34 *Welland County General Hospital v. Building Service Employees, Local 204*, [1965] O.L.A.A. No. 1185 (Arthurs, Wren, and Cromarty)

10-46 *Metropolitan Toronto Police Association and The Metropolitan Toronto Board of Commissioners of Police, re: 1976 Uniform Agreement*, unreported decision of Kenneth P. Swan, arbitrator, Sept. 29, 1976 (excerpt)

10-74 *CUPE v. Ontario (Minister of Labour)* [2003] 1 S.C.R. 539 (Headnote)

Unit 11 – Preservation of Bargaining Rights

11-2 Article: *Contracting-Out Provisions in Canadian Collective Agreements – A Moving Target"*, Jallette and Warrian, Workplace Gazettte. Vol. 5, No. 1 p. 64

11-15 *York Detention Centre Ltd.*, [2010] O.L.R.D. No. 3435, Ontario Labour Relations Board

11-32 *Bayshore Home Health*, [2011] O.L.R.D. No. 1487, Ontario Labour Relations Board

11-48 *Bayshore Home Health (Reconsideration Application)*, [2011] O.L.R.D. No. 2914, Ontario Labour Relations Board

11-54 *Perth and Smiths Falls District Hospital* [2001] O.L.R.D. No. 4643, Ontario Labour Relations Board

Unit 12 – Indirect State Involvement in Public Sector Bargaining

12-2 Excerpt from *Ontario Public Service Employment Labour Law,* Hadwen, Strang, Marvy and Eady, Irwin Law, 2005

12-7 Excerpt from *Reshaping B.C.Health Sector – Appropriate Bargaining Units; Report and Recommendations of James E. Dorsey, Commissioner*, Health Sector Labour Relations Commission of British Columbia, June 30, 1995

12-23 Excerpt from *The Report of the Commission of Inquiry into the Public Service and Public Sector, Volume 2 – Final Report, The Public Sector in British Columbia*, Judi Korbin, Commissioner, June 1993

12-40 *Health Authorities Act*, [RSBC 1996], Chapter 180, Part 3

12-46 *Public Sector Employers Act*, [RSBC 1996] Chapter 384

12-54 British Columbia Public Sector Employer's Council, Bargaining Mandate 2010

12-56 *Canadian Union of Public Employees Locals 189, 408, 3197, 3421, 3671 et al. v. Alberta Health Services et al. v Attorney General of Alberta,* Decision of the Alberta Labour Relations Board (excerpts)

Unit 13 – "Ad Hoc" Interventions in Broader Public Sector Bargaining

13-2 Article (excerpt), "The Laws of Unintended Consequence: The Effect of Labour Legislation on Wages and Strikes, Dachis, Benjamin and Hebdon, Robert, Commentary, No. 304, June, 2010 C.D. Howe Institute

13-17 Preamble, *Social Contract Act*, S.O. 1993 c.5

13-18 *Ontario English Catholic Teachers' Assn. V. Lanark, Leeds and Grenville Country Roman Catholic Separate School Board*, Ontario Court of Appeal, [1998] O.J. No. 3366

13-27 Excerpt, *Public Sector Compensation Restraint to Protect Public Services Act, 2010*, S.O. 2010 c.1 Schedule 24

13-30 *Sunnybrook Health Sciences Centre v. Service Employees International Union Local 2,* unreported decision of Board of Arbitration chaired by R.O. McDowell,August 19, 2010

13-47 *Toronto Transit Commission Labour Disputes Resolution Act, 2011*, S.O. 2011 c.2

13-56 *York University Labour Disputes Resolution Act, 2009,* S.O. 2009 c.1

13-62 *Education Act*, s. 57.2

13-63 "Jeopardy Advisements", September 1975 – 2002, Education Relations Commissions

13-67 *Air Canada v. Canadian Union of Public Employees,* unreported decision of Binding Decision Maker Elizabeth McPherson pursuant to a reference under section 97 of the Canada Labour Code, November 2, 2011

Unit 1 – Purpose of Public Sector Labour Law and Statutory Frameworks

1-2 Selected List of Statutes

1-3 Excerpt – *Crown Employees Collective Bargaining Act*

1-19 Excerpt from *Ontario Public Service Employment Labour Law,* Hadwen, Strang, Marvy and Eady, Irwin Law, 2005

1-21 Wellington, Harry H. and Winter, Ralph K. Jr., *The Limits of Collective Bargaining in Public Employment* (1969) Faculty Scholarship Series, Yale Law School

1-43 Swimmer, Gene and Bartkiw, Tim, *The Future of Public Sector Collective Bargaining in Canada*, Journal of Labour Research, Volume XXSIV, Number 4, Fall 2003, excerpt

1-57 Statistics Canada, Unionization 2011

1-60 Statistics Canada, Chart B